

The Judge Case, A Conspiracy Which Ruined the Theosophical Cause

Ernest E. Pelletier

Published June 2004
Edmonton Theosophical Society
Edmonton Canada
ISBN 0-9681602-3-9

Contents

[Mostly a compilation of the lists of contents present throughout this book. Small additions by the editor of this list of contents (pagination etc.) have not been noted. Larger additions by Katinka Hesselink have been noted with an asterisk: * . These are usually based on the contents of the book itself.]

Part 1

Acknowledgements	vii
Illustrations	ix
Introduction	xi
Explanatory Notes	xv

Judge Case: Chronology	1-309
List of Biographical Sketches	311-312
Supplement to The Judge Case	
Contents	315

Chapter 1	The Early Years	317
Chapter 2	Judge in London and Paris	320
Chapter 3	Judge Goes to India	325
Chapter 4	Judge at Adyar	329
Chapter 5	Back In America	337
Chapter 6	Bertram Keightley	339
Chapter 7	Richard Harte – Troubles at Adyar	343
Chapter 8	Struggles in India	347
Chapter 9	The Wills of H.P.B.	350
Chapter 10	Olcott is Tested – Suspicions Mount	355
Chapter 11	The “Poison” Letter	361
Chapter 12	Suspicions Begin to Sprout	365
Chapter 13	Bertram Keightley Returns to Europe and America	367
Chapter 14	Fears of Dogmatism	370
Chapter 15	Suspicions Take Root – The September 1884 Letter	373
Chapter 16	Indians Sommoned to the CAUSE	382
Chapter 17	W.Q. Judge’s Initiation	384
Chapter 18	Convention of 1893	390
Chapter 19	G.N. Chakravarti	393
Chapter 20	The Proceedings Begin	396
Chapter 21	Delays and Withholdings	401
Chapter 22	Kandalavala and Besant	405
Chapter 23	The Judicial Committee – Pre and Post	408
Chapter 24	Summary	415
Addendum		422
Notes		425
Index to Supplement		445

Works Cited	449
Bibliography of Works by and about William Q. Judge	465
Illustrations: Sources	471

Part 2

[Part two starts with a new page 1]

Illustrations (part 2)	v
Contents (list and description of Appendices)	vii

Appendix A The Case Against W.Q. Judge	1-119
Includes a reprint of the pamphlet of this title published by Annie Besant in 1895. It chronicles the main thrust of the accusations brought before the 1894 Judicial Committee accusing Judge of allegedly adding messages in Master's script to his letters in order to personally gain from it. An analysis by the Compiler describes how there were two editions of this pamphlet which consisted, in part, of the "prosecutor's brief" prepared by his accusers, and also why and when it was drafted. The Reply by William Q. Judge To Charges of Misuse of Mahatmas' Names and Handwriting is also reprinted in full. In addition, there is significant information dealing with the Brass Seal and H.P. Blavatsky's Signet Ring.	
1	A brief account of "The Brass Seal" from New York Sun , November 25, 1894 5
2	Introduction to "An Interesting Letter" – The Theosophical Movement 1875-1950 (p. 426) 10
	"An Interesting Letter. (<i>Written to an Indian Brother.</i>)" by W.Q. Judge Lucifer , Vol. 12, April 1893, pp. 101-104 10
3	"A Letter from Mrs. Besant." Dated "Colombo, December 19 th , 1894" to the Editor of the Daily Chronicle (See Chronology, Dec. 19, 1894 entry; I, p. 127)(Light , Vol. 15, January 12, 1895, pp. 21-22) 13
4	Letter by Bertram Keightley to The Westminster Gezette dated Dec. 23, 1894, Adyar, Madras. 14
	The Theosophical Society and the Westminster Gazette , (pp. 14-16)
5	GENERAL REPORT of the Nineteenth Anniversary of The Theosophical Society , December 25, 26, 27 and 28, 1894. Olcott addresses "The Judge Case" 16
6	Letter " <i>To G.R.S. Mead, Esq.</i> " By Constance Wachtmeister. Lucifer , Vol. 16, April 1895, p. 164 18
7	Letter by William Lindsay to C. Wachtmeister, and his response to her comments. 19
	<i>To the Editor of The Irish Theosophist</i> , Vol. 3, May 1895, pp. 141-142
8	A Narrative . By Alexander Fullerton, May 14, 1895 21
9	The Case Against W.Q. Judge. Compiler's Analysis 25
	88 page pamphlet by Annie Besant 34
10	The European Convention met at London on July 4, 1895. Theosophy (ULT), Vol. 10, 1921-1922, pp. 398-407 81
11	Introduction to Mr. Judge's Replies (by the Compiler) 88
12	Isis and The Mahatmas. A Reply by William Q. Judge (30 page pamphlet) 88
	To the Editor of The Sun (pp. 1-3) 88
	A Reply From William Q. Judge to The Westminster Gazette (pp. 3-13) 90
13	Reply By William Q. Judge to Charges of Misuse of Mahatmas' Names and Handwritings. 29 page pamphlet published by William Q. Judge in 1895 95

14	Editorial comments by Annie Besant giving her version of what happened to H.P.B.'s ring after H.P.B. died. (Lucifer , Vol. 16, June 1895, pp. 269-270)	115
	Illustrations of H.P.B.'s Signet Ring	116
	Regarding H.P.B.'s Signet Ring – Compiler's Comment	116
15	Addendum regarding H.P.B.'s ring	117
Appendix B The Prayag Letter		121-164
	Deals with this famous Letter – how some Brahmans were concerned that Theosophy was a vehicle for Buddhist teachings rather than Vedic/Brahmanism. The disputed “By Master’s Direction” is also included, with pertinent related documents which deal with this whole crisis.	
1	Letter No. CXXXIV [134] from Dehra Dun. Friday Nov. 4 th 1881. (a.k.a. The “Prayag Letter”) The Mahatma Letters to A.P. Sinnett , Second Edition, pp. 461-464	125
2	“The Theosophical Society As Related to Brahmanism and Buddhism.” “To The Brahmins of India.” The Path , Vol. 8, May 1893, pp. 52-56 [By W.Q. Judge *] By Master’s Direction , E.S.T., November 3, 1894.	127
3	[W.Q. Judge explains his position in the EST and its history and claims sole responsibility for the EST*]	130
4	“A Mahatma’s Message To Some Brahmans.” The Path , Vol. 9, March 1895, pp. 430-431 [By W.Q. Judge *]	138
5	“Postscript.” The Theosophist , Vol. 16, April 1895, pp. 475-476 [By H.S.O. Olcott *]	140
6	“Adepts and Mediums.” The Irish Theosophist , Vol. 3, May 1895, pp. 133-136 [By Basil Crump]	142
7a	Introductory paragraph from The Theosophical Movement 1875-1950 , p. 250	144
7b	Report of Proceedings, Ninth Annual Convention, American Section T.S., AND First Convention, Theosophical Society in America , Boston, April 28-29, 1895, pp. 16-17	144
8	“East and West.” Lucifer , Vol. 16, May 1895, pp. 185-194. [By Annie Besant *]	145
9	“H.S. Olcott vs. H.P.B.” The Path , Vol. 10, June 1895, pp. 81-83 [By W.Q. Judge *]	150
10	“Dr. Hartmann Reads the ‘Postscript’.” The Path , Vol. 10, June 1895, pp. 96-97.	152
11	“The Prayag Letter.” (Letters by A. Besant and W.Q. Judge) Lucifer , Vol. 16, July 1895, pp. 375-379	153
12a	“H.P.B. Was Not Deserted By The Masters.” [By W.Q. Judge *] Theosophy (The Path) , Vol. 11, April 1896, pp. 14-18	157
12b	“CORRESPONDENCE.” “ <i>To The Editor of Theosophy</i> ” from A.P. Sinnett. Theosophy (The Path) , Vol 11, July 1896, pp. 122-123	160
12c	Letter from A.P. Sinnett to Alexander Fullerton. First published in the Boston Herald , April 27, 1895. Reprinted in Theosophy , Vol. 10, October 1922, pp. 394-395	160
13	“Messages From The Masters.” Theosophy , Vol. 8, January 1920, pp. 67-70	162-164
14	Note on the “Prayag Letter”. Theosophy , Vol. 10, October 1922, p. 407	164
Appendix C Historical Sketch		165-211

	Contains historical documents dealing with the records of the Theosophical Society and the conflict which arose between the President of the Theosophical Society, Colonel Olcott, and W.Q. Judge, the Vice-President. Some of these documents show the difficulties Judge encountered because of the lack of communications and instructions from the President. A number of original Applications are included, as well as Judge's 1884 sketches of the Adyar Headquarters.	
1	"Historical Sketch of The Theosophical Society." <i>From the Records of the T.S., from 1875 to the present day.</i> [read to the convention of the T.S. in the USA in 1895 by Mr. Wade *]	169
2	"Historic Theosophical Leaves." The very first pages from the Minute Book of the Theosophical Society, in the handwriting of John Storer Cobb. [in fact a description of those pages *] Photographic plate (facsimile) of the September 8 th , 1875, MINUTES	174 176
3	"The Theosophical Society." INSIDE FACTS AS TO ITS ORGANISATION. – A <i>DE FACTO</i> BODY. – THE REAL T.S. IN NEW YORK – THE PRESIDENT STILL A DELEGATE TO FOREIGN LANDS, AND HOLDING OVER IN OFFICE. [Plus introduction *]	177
4	Mrs. Keightley addresses the Ninth Annual Convention of the American Section of the T.S., First Convention of the T.S. in America, and explains why there is a need to change the By-laws, followed by Proclamation drafted by Mr. Spencer.	181
5	Elliot B. Page's Diploma, signed by Abner Doubleday as pro tem President of The Theosophical Society of New York. The First American Branch established in St. Louis, Missouri Photographed copy of the first Charter issued for an American Branch of the T.S.	184 184 185
6	A circular letter issued by members of the T.S. in New York and Brooklyn, through Henry T. Patterson, FTS signed by 121 FTS members. It was unofficial and an individual declaration of views.	186
7	"The American Board of Control" by Compiler; Facsimile of its Seal. Notes with regard to the Applicants for membership.	190 191
8	Application for Fellowship in the T.S. by Henry T. Patterson The T.S. Obligation form	192 193
9	Application for Fellowship in the T.S. by George D. Ayers The T.S. Obligation form	194 195
10	Application for Fellowship in the T.S. by Jerome A. Anderson The T.S. Obligation form	196 197
11	Application for Fellowship in the T.S. by Abbott B. Clark The T.S. Obligation form	198 199
12	Application for Fellowship in the T.S. by Edward B. Rambo The T.S. Obligation form	200 201
13	Application for Fellowship in the T.S. by Myron H. Phelps Secretaries and Branch Presidents please note:	202 203
14	Application for Fellowship in the T.S. by Joseph Hall Fussell Secretaries and Branch Presidents please note:	204 205
15	Diploma issued by The Theosophical Society in America **, to Charles A. Lazenby	206
16	Sketches of Adyar Headquarters by William Q. Judge. "Habitations of H.P.B." The Path , Vol. 7, June 1892, pp. 71-75 "Headquarters at Adyar in 1882." The Theosophist , Vol. 52, August 1931, p. 658	207 210
**	The T.S. in A. was sometimes called the "Hargrove Group". After the	

organization under Katherine Tingley was renamed “The Universal Brotherhood” in 1898, Hargrove and others fought to regain control over the name “Theosophical Society in America” which had been adopted at the Boston Convention in 1895.

Appendix D Letters from W.Q. Judge to E.T. Hargrove

213-293

Contains letters Judge wrote to Ernest T. Hargrove and which Hargrove first published, with his annotations, in **The Theosophical Quarterly**. They are reprinted here for the first time since then. These letters give an insightful look at Judge’s character, his dedication to the Theosophical CAUSE and the strains he was under.

“The THEOSOPHICAL QUARTERLY is the official organ of the original Theosophical Society founded in New York by H.P. Blavatsky, W.Q. Judge and others, in 1875.

We wish to make it clear that we have no connection whatsoever with any other organization calling itself Theosophical, headed by Mrs. Besant or others, nor similar bodies, the purposes and methods of which are wholly foreign to our own.

EDITORS, THE THEOSOPHICAL QUARTERLY”

The following letters from W.Q. Judge were originally published in **The Theosophical Quarterly**.)

Part I	Vol. 28, April 1931, pp. 314-326	217-227
	Introduction by E.T. Hargrove	217
	Letters, August 18 th , 1893 to December 15 th , 1893	220
Part II	Vol. 29, July 1931; pp. 35-45	228-236
	Comments from E.T. Hargrove	228
	Letters, December 27 th , 1893 to June 6 th , 1894	229
Part III	Vol. 29, October 1931; pp. 107-122	237-249
	Examination of facts by Hargrove of the July 1894 Committees	237
	After Judge’s return to New York: August 7 th , 1894 to Oct. 20 th , 1894	246
Part IV	Vol. 29, January 1932; pp. 238-247	205-257
	Following the Judge “trial” in London and the attacks of the Westminster Gazette .	250
	Insightful comments by Hargrove on post Committee hearings in London	
	Letters, November 19 th , 1894 to December 28 th , 1894	253
Part V	Vol. 30, July 1932; pp. 27-38	258-267
	Examination of facts as a result of Besant’s oratory skills and the resolution passed by the Indian Convention demanding for Judge to resign.	258
	Letters, January 18 th , 1895 to August 5 th , 1895	261
	Letters from W.Q. Judge. (Dated May 20 th , 1895.) [from Letters That Have Helped Me]	265
Part VI	Vol. 30, October 1932; pp. 122-129	268-275
	After visiting his parents in England Hargrove returns to New York.	268
	Letter, August 23 rd , 1895 to October 11 th , 1895	268
Part VII	Vol. 30, January 1933; pp. 206-212	276-281
	The members in Boston, and Hargrove’s return to the lecture circuit.	276
	Letters, October 16 th , 1895 to November 19 th , 1895	276
Part VIII	Vol. 31, July 1933; pp. 31-35	282-286
	Hargrove goes to stay with Judge in Aiken, South Carolina	282
	Letters, November 27 th , 1895 to December 19 th , 1895	282
Part IX	Vol 32, January 1934; pp. 198-205	287-293
	Hargrove with Judge in Aiken, South Carolina	287
	Letters, January 7 th , 1896 to January 31 st , 1896	289

Appendix E Contentious Letters		295-326
Includes documents which provide the reader the opportunity to study for themselves the confusion and mistrust which sprouted within the Movement ; how theosophist turned on theosophist and sides were being drawn.		
1	Letter from William Q. Judge to "Editor <i>Irish Theosophist</i> ." "The Charges against William Q. Judge." The Irish Theosophist , Vol. 3, February 1895, pp. 85-86	299
2	"Truth and Occultism." By Archibald Keightley Keightley includes letters of support for Judge's character. The Irish Theosophist , Vol. 3, March 1895, pp. 89-98	300
3	Letter from Archibald Keightley to G.R.S. Mead dated March 19 th , 1895 The Vahan , Vol. 4, April 1895, pp. 4-5	306
4	Response by G.R.S. Mead to A. Keightley's letter. The Vahan , Vol. 4, April 1895, pp. 6	309
5	"The 'Chinaman.'" By Annie Besant The Vahan , Vol. 4, May 1895, pp.4-5	310
6	"THE JUDGE CASE." "Final Refusal to Give Copies of Documents to Accused." Letter from W.Q. Judge. The Irish Theosophist , Vol. 3, May 1895, pp. 132-133	311
7	"Adepts and Mediums." By Basil Crump. The Irish Theosophist , Vol. 3, May 1895, pp. 133-136	312
8	Letter from E.T. Hargrove "To the Editor of THE IRISH THEOSOPHIST" Letter dated April 17 th , 1895. Vol. 3, May 1895, pp. 137-140	314
9	Letter from Gordon Rowe and Walter H. Box "To the Editor of THE IRISH THEOSOPHIST" Letter dated May 2 nd , 1895. Vol. 3, May 1895, p. 140	317
10	Letters from E.T. Hargrove "To the Editor of THE IRISH THEOSOPHIST" Two letters, dated May 14 th and May 31 st , 1895. Vol. 3, June 1895, pp. 160-164	318
11	Letter from Roger Hall "To the Editor of THE IRISH THEOSOPHIST" Letter dated May 25 th , 1895. Vol. 3, June 1895, pp. 164-165	322
12	"The Legend of 'Che-Yew-Tsang.'" Introductory remarks by G.R.S. Mead. Letter dated May 21 st , 1895 from J.C. Keightley "To the Editor of THE VĀHAN."	323
13	Letter from Herbert Burrows "To the Editor of THE VĀHAN." Letter dated June 19 th , 1895. Vol. 4, July 1895, p. 4	325
14	Editorial comments by G.R.S. Mead	325
Appendix F W.Q. Judge's Last Messages		327-366
Contains two items from Judge's notebooks/diaries. These have never been published before and were Judge's last entries before his death. The first, prepared by him for the Aryan Theosophical Society, was written one week after the First Convention of the Theosophical Society in America held in Boston, April 1895. The second is his Annual Address to The Aryan T.S. in November 1895. Also included is a short account of Judge's last days, penned by E.T. Hargrove, and tributes at the cremation by some of Judge's closest friends and co-workers.		
1	W.Q. Judge's Last Messages (An Introduction). By Compiler	331
2	Transcript of Mr. Judge's May 7 th , 1895 remarks	332
	Handwritten notes of letter prepared by Mr. Judge and read on his behalf before The Aryan T.S. on May 7 th , 1895. (From the archives of The Theosophical Society, Pasadena – previously unpublished). [The note "Read before Aryan Br on May 7 '95" is in Joseph H. Fussell's handwriting.]	333

3	Transcript of Mr. Judge's notes for the Anniversary of the T.S. Handwritten notes by Mr. Judge, President, of this Annual Address to the Aryan T.S., read on his behalf before The Aryan T.S. in November 1895. (from the Archives of The Theosophical Society, Pasadena – previously unpublished) [Date was added by Joseph H. Fussell, Mr. Judge's private secretary]	338 342
4	"The Last Days of W.Q. Judge." By E.T. Hargrove. Theosophy (The Path) , Vol. 11, May 1896, pp. 34-37	360
5	"The Cremation." By Claude Falls Wright. Tributes by C.F. Wright, E.T. Hargrove and James Pryse. Theosophy (The Path) , Vol. 11, May 1896, pp. 38-40	363
Appendix G Judge's Diaries and Katherine Tingley		367-419
Investigates the post mortem pandemonium which befell the members of the Theosophical Society in America after the death of W.Q. Judge. It appraises some of the controversies surrounding Judge's Diaries and the Tingley successorship.		
1	Questioning Interpretations of Ambiguous Historical Documents Introductory Comments to Appendix G. By Compiler	371
2	"E.S.T. – To The Members of The E.S.T." Dated April 3 rd , 1896. A verbatim report of a general E.S.T. meeting held in New York at Headquarters on Sunday, March 29 th , 1896. Issued after Judge's death by "Council".	374
3	The Tingley "Successorship" The Theosophical Movement, 1875-1925 , pp. 667-681	386
4	"The Judge 'Occult Diary', Vindication of Tingley, Hargrove, Fussell" The O.E. Library Critic , Vol. 22, September 1932	393
5	Letter from James M. Pryse to Editor, The Canadian Theosophist . Vol. 13, June 1932, pp. 124-126	395
6	"A Letter from W.Q. Judge to Katherine Tingley" The O.E. Library Critic , Vol. 22, October 1932	396
7	"A Letter from W.Q. Judge to Dr. Archibald Keightley" The O.E. Library Critic , Vol. 22, November 1932	398
8	Mrs. Tingley Channels the Recently Deceased William Q. Judge "Spiritualism and the Rise of Katherine Tingley" California Utopia: Point Loma: 1897-1942 , pp. 16-17	401
9	"More about the Judge 'Diary'" The O.E. Library Critic , Vol. 22, December 1932, pp. 6-9	403
10	"CORRESPONDENCE." " <i>To the Editors of the Theosophical Quarterly:</i> " Theosophical Quarterly , Vol. 31, July 1933, pp. 88-89	407
11	"The Judge Diary Question – Mr. Hargrove Speaks" The Editor comments on Hargrove's letter. The O.E. Library Critic , Vol. 22, March 1933	408
12	"William Q. Judge and Katherine Tingley – I" The O.E. Library Critic , Vol. 23, November-December 1934	410
13	"William Q. Judge and Katherine Tingley – II" The O.E. Library Critic , Vol. 23, January-February 1935	412
14	"Covina Explains" By Charles J. Ryan The Canadian Theosophist , Vol. 27, September 1946, pp. 212-219	414
Appendix H Miscellaneous Letters		421-452

	Examines some of the letters and observations from the post “Judge Case” controversy. The impact on theosophical thought some of the main players had, and how the modern theosophists’s views have been molded by these ideas and misconceptions are examined.	
1	Introduction to “Miscellaneous Items” Introductory Comments to Appendix H. By Compiler	425
2	“The Sweet-Tongued Voices of Illusion.” The Irish Theosophist, Vol. 3, August 1895, pp. 200-203 Letter/article by Alice L. Cleather and Basil Crump.	427
3	Obtained from the H.P.B. library. It is doubled spaced, with poor print quality, unsigned but with the authors’ initials and the Library Seal Compiler’s Comments	430 433
4	Letters from Master K.H. to Henry Olcott Letters From The Masters of The Wisdom, 1881-1888 , pp. 50-56, 116-118. Theosophical Publishing House, Adyar, Madras, India, 1919 [First Series]. (Transcribed and Compiled by C. Jinarajadasa)	434
5	“Memorandum of Interview with Dr. Annie Besant.” Notes and Comments procured by William Mulliss during his interview with Besant on October 6, 1926	437
6	One page statement by B.P. Wadia Typed document obtained from Dallas TenBroeck	443
7	“A Case of Amnesia in an ‘Arhat’.” By H.N. Stokes. The O.E. Library Critic , Vol. 16, November 1926	444
8	“Mrs. Besant and the Judge Case.” By H.N. Stokes The O.E. Library Critic , Vol. 16, January 1927	447
9	“Address at a General Meeting in London by the O.H. (1909).” By Annie Besant. The Link , August 1911, pp. 53-67	447
	Appendix I Judge’s Pseudonyms and Words of Wisdom	453-484
	Provides the reader with information regarding the pseudonyms used (and possibly used) by Judge, as well as quotations from his writings on various theosophical subjects.	
1	William Quan Judge’s Pen-Names (Pseudonyms)	457
2	“Gleanings From Unpublished Letters of W.Q.J.” The English Theosophist Vol. 2, 1898 – Vol. 3. 1900	460
3	Words of Wisdom by W.Q. Judge [Various sources *]	467
4	“What is Occultism?” Theosophy , Vol. 8, October 1920	472
5	“Musings on The True Theosophist’s Path” The Path , Vol. 1, August 1886 – February 1887	473
6	“Living The Higher Life.” [T[ed] G. D[avy], containing W.Q.J.-quotes *]	478
	Appendix J Astrological Observations	483-511
1	Life in a Borrowed Body. By Compiler	487
2	Astrological Analysis, By Chris McRae Basic Delineation of Natal Chart of William Q. Judge Illness at Age Seven Did Mr. Judge Have a Powerful Spiritual Experience On or About September 17 th , 1884? Did Death Occur by Poisoning?	494 497 449 501
3	Assessment of William Q. Judge’s Astrological Chart, by Dr. A. Basu Astrological Data: Dasa and Bukti Periods of Planets Analysis of Important periods of W.Q. Judge’s Life	503 504 505
4	“The Soul Photographed” by Nizida The Theosophic Isis , Vol. 2, February 1897, pp. 426-430	510

